THE FOSSIL AVIAN ASSEMBLAGE FROM WEEKES CAVE (N-15), NULLARBOR PLAIN, SOUTH AUSTRALIA: CORRECTIONS, ADDITIONS AND REINTERPRETATION

R. F. BAIRD

INTRODUCTION

G. F. van Tets (1974) described a subfossil avian assemblage from Weekes Cave (N-15) on the Nullarbor Plain (sensu stricto), South Australia. which was collected at random from the floor surface by members of the Cave Exploration Group of South Australia. In his report he referred 15 specimens to eight species of bird (see Table 1). For this species list he suggested a taphonomy (history of fossilisation) of the deposit, which included both predator accumulated (allochthonous) species and species accumulated by being trapped in the cave (autochthonous: Baird in press a). His palaeoenvironmental reconstruction suggested that wetter conditions previously 'prevailed' on the Nullarbor as compared with those of recent times, and that:

"as a group, the bird remains found in the cave are those that one would expect to see in savannah woodlands with areas of open grassland and shallow pools of water. They may have come on to the Nullarbor Plain during brief spells of exceptionally wet weather and sought shelter in the cave when the country dried up again."

During the course of PhD studies (Baird 1986), I had reason to review all of the previous studies completed on fossil avian remains in southern Australia and noted a significant number of misidentifications in the determinations of van Tets (1974). The misidentifications (and therefore their use in palaeoenvironmental reconstruction) combined with a misinterpretation of the use of

material of this type in palaeoenvironmental analysis requires correcting both the species listing and the interpretation.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The material reported on herein is housed in the South Australian Museum, Department of Palaeontology. To the best of my knowledge all of the avian material available has been studied. That which was not reported by van Tets (1974) includes Masked Owl Tyto novaehollandiae (26202), Button-quail *Turnix* sm. sp. (31421), a charadriiforme (31422), a honeyeater (31423), and a passeriforme (31424). Modern comparative material used in the identifications was provided by the Department of Ornithology, Museum of Victoria, and Department of Ornithology, South Australian Museum. Registration numbers can be found in the materials section of each speciesaccount. A prefix P' should accompany each number but has been omitted for conservation of space.

Taxa previously unknown from sub-fossil and fossil deposits are noted (unpublished records in the faunal lists of Rich & van Tets (1982) are not considered formally confirmed records as full diagnoses are not available).

Geographical ranges for each species are here assumed to be the same as the current range and unless otherwise noted include the area surrounding Weekes Cave.

tub.

tuberculum

Anatomical terminology follows Baumel *et al.* (1979).

All measurements in the text are in millimetres. Standard measurements are indicated in brackets and follow the guidelines in von den Driesch (1976) unless stated otherwise. All measurements were taken with vernier callipers accurate to 0.05 mm and were rounded to the nearest 0.1 mm.

Botanical nomenclature follows the guidelines of Specht (1981).

For the basis on which species identification and palaeoenvironmental reconstruction using avian remains in Australia are accomplished, see Baird (1989) and Baird (in press a), respectively.

List of abbreviations used in text.

art. articularis **ATSF** Acacia tall scrub formation crista cta ccd. coracoid carpometacarpus cmc. complete com. cranium cran. dist. distal **EOFF** Eucalyptus open forest formation **EWF** Eucalyptus woodland formation fac. facies fem. femur for. foramen/foramina frag. fragment hum. humerus huml. humeral incom. incomplete mand. mandible M.N.I. minimum number of individuals MOSF Mallee open scrub formation N number of elements in the statistical population osc. os coxae pel. pelvis proc. processus prox. proximal ram. ramus rost. rostrum scap. scapula σ -1 standard deviation stm. sternum syn. svnsacrum tbt. tibiotarsus tmt. tarsometatarsus troc. trochlea

 μ mean

y.B.P. years Before Present

SYSTEMATIC PALAEONTOLOGY

Class AVES

Order Ciconiiformes Family Threskiornithidae

SPOONBILL SP.

Platalea sp.

Material. Associated partial skeleton [17927: including incom. cran., left mand. art., prox. end right hum., dist. end right hum., com. left hum., com. left ulna, com. right & left radius, com. left cmc., incom. right & left scap., com. left ccd., stm. frags, incom. pel., prox. end right fem., dist. end right fem., com. left fem., com. right & left tbt., com. right & left tmt., 13 costal frags, 4 phal., com. right & left fib., com. os dorsale, 8 vert.].

Characters. Species determination is not considered possible due to the degree of mensural overlap between the two species currently inhabiting continental Australia (Royal Spoonbill P. regia and Yellow-billed Spoonbill P. flavipes). Remarks. This material can probably be considered autochthonous, as hypothesised by van Tets (1974) and the probable cause for the occurrence of the Australian Pelican Pelecanus conspicillatus in N-224 Cave seen by Kevin Mott (pers. comm.). A scenario provided as explanation of these otherwise unlikely occurrences is that after the sporadic downpours that occur every couple of years, these animals come to feed in the water-filled claypans. After these have dried out, the animals are drawn to the dongas and occasionally find their way into the caves which frequently have surface water available. Alternatively those individuals which died on the plain may have been brought to the caves by scavengers. Currently there are occasional downpours which are sufficient to fill the claypans on the Nullarbor Plain with water (Beard 1975), especially in 1930 and 1955 (Johnson & Baird 1970).

Order Accipitriformes Family Accipitridae HARRIER SP.

Circus sp.

Material. 2 incom. skull (18060, 31420), incom. syn. (18061).

Characters. Regarded as an accipitrid due to the large oblate external nares, lacrymals not fused

to the skull and the rostrum which is narrow and elongate.

Characters considered diagnostic for the genus Circus include: Skull (viewed laterally), 1. cta lateralis et cta ventralis of os palatinum ventrally expressed and distinct, 2. distal border of os palatinum rounded, 3. external nares large, 4. width across os nasale narrow, 5. cranium dorsoventrally flattened, 6. temporal fossa narrow, 7. interorbital bridge narrow, 8. zoňa elastica palatina narrow, 9. rostrum tapers gradually anteriorly (viewed ventrally), 10. rostrum dorsoventrally shallow, 11. very pronounced crista shielding the area where the quadrate articulation occurs: Pelvis (viewed posteriorly), the ala postacetabulari ilii cuts in medially very abruptly and not tapered as in Accipiter.

Species-determinations are not considered possible, for I could find no morphological differences between the bones of the two *Circus* species currently inhabiting Australia and their mensural characters overlap extensively.

Remarks. Both species of *Circus* inhabiting Australia occur in structurally similar habitats, where Spotted Harrier *C. assimilis* ". . . ranges over plains and open wooded grassland" and Marsh Harrier *C. aeruginosus* ". . . inhabits open swampy country . . ." and in the inland near bores (Blakers *et al.* 1984). *C. assimilis* has been recorded as nesting on the Nullarbor Plain after greater than average rainfall (Klau 1985) and occurs on the spinifex plain to the north of the Bunda Plateau (Storr 1985).

Family Falconidae AUSTRALIAN KESTREL

Falco cenchroides

Material. Incom. skull and mandible (18062). Characters. Considered to belong to the Falconidae by the external nares being rounded and small and the lacrymal fused to the skull. The rostrum is broad and short.

The only genus of the family to occur in Australia is *Falco*. The species determination is based upon mensural characters: *F. cenchroides* is smaller than all other species of *Falco* in Australia and the subfossil material agrees in mensural criteria with this species (e.g. GL *F. cenchroides* $\mu = 33.7$, σ -1 = 0.9, OR = 32.0-35.0 and N = 12; subfossil GL = 34.9).

Remarks. Falco cenchroides occurs throughout

Australia and is capable of surviving in all terrestrial habitats.

This species is known to nest in the caves of the Bunda Plateau (Richards 1971), and part of the subfossil material may represent normal attrition of individuals nesting in the entrance to Weekes Cave. *F. cenchroides* may increase in abundance through dispersal onto the Nullarbor Plain after greater than average rainfall (Klau 1985), which is correlated with an increase in the abundance of prey items (Dell 1979).

Order Gruiformes Family Turnicidae LITTLE BUTTON-QUAIL Turnix sp. cf. T. velox

Material. Incom. cran. (18065), com. left hum. (31421), incom. right tbt. (18067).

Characters. See Baird (in press a) for the characters involved in the identification of the genus *Turnix*.

Mensural characters are considered to be of little use in separating *T. velox* and Red-chested Button-quail *T. pyrrhothorax*, therefore the species-determination relies upon biogeographic probability (see Table 1, in Baird in press a).

Remarks. Of the four skulls previously referred to this genus only one is considered correctly identified, the others are referable to Thick-billed Grasswren *Amytornis textilis* (18063, 18064) and an indeterminate passeriforme (18066).

Turnix velox is abundant on the Bunda Plateau, and areas to the north, in years of greater than average precipitation, but largely confined to the CLSF (Brooker et al. 1979, Storr 1985).

Order Charadriiformes Family Indeterminate

Material. Incom. left tbt. (31422).

Characters. The characters used in the identification of this element as a charadriiforme include: **Tibiotarsus** (proximal end), 1. anteroproximally flattened shaft, 2. broad facies gastrocnemialis, 3. very narrow sul. intercristalis; (distal end), 1. cond. medialis extends laterally, 2. inc. intercondylaris relatively small and rounded, 3. cond. medialis proximodistally flattened.

Order Strigiformes Family Tytonidae MASKED OWL Tyto novaehollandiae Material. Incom. skull (26202).

Characters. The skull is referred to the genus *Tyto* based on the following suite of characters: **Rostrum**, 1. proximodistally elongate and dorsoventrally flattened, 2. os palatinum proximodistally elongate and laterally flattened: Cranium, 1. surface swollen and undulating, 2. deep furrow along the whole of the cranial midline, 3. cranium not greatly expanded distally. Remarks. Although Tyto novaehollandiae has been recorded from the Nullarbor Plain several times, only two of these records are strictly acceptable (Parker 1977). This species has been suggested to be the accumulator of vertebrate material in caves across Australia (Archer & Baynes 1972, Mees 1964, Wakefield 1972) but recent evidence indicates that Barn Owl Tyto alba is a more frequent accumulator of vertebrate material (Baird in press a).

Order Passeriformes
Family Orthonychidae
NULLARBOR QUAIL-THRUSH
Cinclosoma alisteri

Material. 2 incom. skulls (18072-18073), incom. left tbt. (18077).

Characters. Referred to the genus Cinclosoma by virtue of the holorhinal condition of the external nares, expanded auditory bullae, proportionately large crania and small delicate rostra (see Parker 1982 for illustration).

Species determination is based upon the small size of the crania which in C. alisteri should be smaller than that of all other species of Cinclosoma, based upon postcranial elements, although no cranial comparative material exists (Baird in prep. a). The most striking feature in the specimens (18072 & 18073) is the holorhinal condition of the external nares, therefore precluding their placement within the Artamidae. Remarks. These specimens were formerly referred to White-breasted Woodswallow Artamus leucorhynchus (van Tets 1974), but the renewed study of this material leads me to believe that only one of the specimens actually belongs to the genus Artamus (18071: due to its amphirhinal condition; see species account for the Whitebrowed Woodswallow Artamus superciliosus).

The species is restricted to the CLSF of the Bunda Plateau (see Baird in prep b for a full discussion).

Family Maluridae THICK-BILLED GRASSWREN Amytornis textilis

Material. 2 incom. skull (18063 & 18064), com. mand. (18074), com. left tbt. (18076).

Characters. See Baird (in prep. b) for the suite of characters used in the identification of this material as *Amytornis textilis*.

Remarks. The skulls were formerly referred to *Turnix* sp. and the other material to an unidentified passeriforme. Throughout most of its range *Amytornis textilis* is restricted to chenopod low scrub formation. The presence of this species on the Nullarbor Plain provides additional evidence for a model of speciation for birds on the Bunda Plateau (Baird in prep. b) which suggests that the formation of the Barton Sandhills sometime in the late Pleistocene was the physical barrier to further genetic interchange.

Family Meliphagidae SINGING HONEYEATER

cf. Lichenostomus virescens

Material. 2 incom. skull (18069, 31423) Characters. Considered to belong in the family Meliphagidae based on its long, posteriorly

attenuate palatines.

I here tentatively refer the specimen to Lichenostomus virescens on the grounds of size. Remarks. The specimen (18069) was incorrectly referred to Rufous Songlark Cinclorhamphus mathewsi in van Tets (1974). The condition of the palatines precludes its placement in Cinclorhamphus where the palatines are posteriorly short and end abruptly.

Family Estrildidae Indeterminate species

Material. Incom. cran. (18070).

Characters. The suite of characters used to identify the material as estrildid include:

Rostrum, 1. Laterally broad, 2. anterodorsally flattened, 3. apatura nasalis ossea inset behind the broad face of the os nasale.

Family Artamidae WHITE-BROWED WOODSWALLOW Artamus superciliosus

Material. incom. skull (18071).

Characters. Referred to the genus Artamus for the following characters: Rostrum, 1.

amphirhinal nostril condition, 2. narrow,

posteriorly projecting parallel os palatinum lamella caudolateralis: Cranium, 1. bifurcated zygomatic proc.

Species determination is based upon morphological characters. Due to the combination of having a stout head and long gracile rostrum, the specimen is referred to Artamus superciliosus (LI = 21.9, Gb = 18.2). Remarks. van Tets (1974) referred three subfossil crania (18071-18073) to A. leucorhynchus. Of these, only one belongs to Artamus (18071) while the other two belong to the genus Cinclosoma (see the species account for Cinclosoma alisteri).

Identification of the species is based upon the lengths of the rostra and the breadth of the crania. The six Australian species in the genus Artamus can be split into two groups. One group includes species with long rostra and the other includes species with short rostra. The species composing the first group are A. leucorhynchus, A. superciliosus, and Masked Woodswallow A. personatus. The species in the second group are Little Woodswallow A. minor, Black-faced Woodswallow A. cinereus, and Dusky Woodswallow A. cyanopterus.

The species-determination of the only specimen referred to *Artamus* was incorrectly assigned by van Tets (1974) to *A. leucorhynchus* but instead should be referred to *A. superciliosus*. It is clearly not *A. leucorhynchus* because it lacks the broad interorbital region and stout, long rostrum characteristic of this species.

Artamus superciliosus is abundant on the Bunda Plateau and occurs in both MOSF and ATSF (Brooker et al. 1979).

Family Indeterminate

Material. 2 incom. skull (18066, 18075), incom. stm. (18068), incom. syn. (31424).

Characters. Due to the incomplete nature of the skulls and the sternum (lacking both lateral edges), I regard them as indeterminate to familial level.

Remarks. One of the skulls was referred to *Turnix* sp. (18066) and the sternum was referred to the Brown Songlark *Cinclorhamphus cruralis* in van Tets (1974).

DISCUSSION

A revised species list is given in Table 1, with

TABLE: 1. Identifications of the material from Weekes Cave exemplifying the differences between those of van Tets (1974) and those proposed herein.

van Tets ID

Threskiornithidae

Platibis flavipes

Accipitridae

Accipiter fasciatus

Falconidae

Falco cenchroides

Turnicidae

Turnix sp.

Sylviidae

Cinclorhamphus · cruralis

C. mathewsi

Estrildidae

Poephila guttata

Artamidae

Artamus leucorhynchus

Baird ID

Threskiornithidae

Platalea sp.

Accipitridae

Circus sp.

Falconidae

Falco cenchroides

Turnicidae

Turnix sp. cf. T. velox

Charadriiformes

Indeterminate

Tytonidae

Tyto novaehollandiae

Orthonychidae

Cinclosoma alisteri

Maluridae

Amytornis textilis

Meliphagidae

cf. Lichenostomus virescens

Estrildidae

Indeterminate

Artamidae

Artamus superciliosus

Indeterminate

comparisons with the original identifications. There was a minimum of 11 species identified from Weekes Cave and, of them, two (i.e. *Platalea* sp. and *Amytornis textilis*) have not been recorded from the Bunda Plateau. As previously discussed, the occurrence of *Platalea* sp. was probably a one-off event, not dependent upon an amelioration in climate. The presence of *Amytornis textilis* on the Bunda Plateau has wider biogeographic implications which are discussed in Baird (in prep. b).

The presence of the *Platalea flavipes* and *Artamus leucorhynchus* was used by van Tets (1974) to indicate ". . . wetter conditions than have prevailed on the Nullarbor in recent times" and that "as a group, the bird remains found in the cave are those one would expect to see in savannah woodlands with areas of open grassland and shallow pools of water." In order to make this palaeoenvironmental interpretation van Tets (1974) must have assumed contemporaneity for the subfossil assemblage collected from the cave.

Given a subfossil vertebrate assemblage which was collected solely from the floor of a cave one can no more logically argue for the contemporaneity of the material than one can that it is non-contemporaneous. Assuming that the floor surface is stable, and has been so for thousands of years, then the accumulation of material on that floor could have been ongoing for the length of time that the surface has been present. Unless one knows the history of the cave-floor surface then no argument of contemporaneity will be supported. In fact assemblages of vertebrate material collected from cave-floor surfaces are more likely to be non-contemporaneous.

If contemporaneity of the assemblage is assumed with no constraints on time, then a reconstruction of the palaeoenvironment may be provided. Radiocarbon dates on vertebrate and charcoal material collected from the floor of caves on the Bunda Plateau include: 180 ± 76 y.B.P. (Merrilees 1970), 390 ± 210 y.B.P. (W.A.I.T. 98: Baynes 1987), 2,200 ± 96 y.B.P. (NSW - 30: Lowry & Merrilees 1969), and 3,280 ± 90 y.B.P. (GaK-693: Partridge 1967) and $4,650 \pm 153$ y.B.P. (NSW-28c: Lowry & Merrilees 1969). Given a greater sample size the range of absolute dates on material collected from the surfaces of cave floors could easily be extended into the Late Pleistocene, unfortunately there can be no time contraints placed upon the material. Therefore,

even if contemporaneity of the assemblage is assumed, one cannot place this assemblage into any useful time frame.

I suggest that the assumption of contemporaneity of the vertebrate assemblage cannot be justified. Therefore a paleoenvironmental interpretation is not warranted. With the reidentification of one of the species van Tets believed indicated an ameliorated climate (i.e. Artamus leucorhynchus), and the explanation of the presence of the Platalea sp. likely to be the result of a brief downpour, there is no real reason to propose a climate any different from that of today.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to extend my thanks to Neville Pledge, Curator, South Australian Museum, for the loan of the Weekes Cave material.

Comparative material used in this study was made available largely due to the kind assistance of Les Christidis and Belinda Gillies, Department of Ornithology, Museum of Victoria; Shane Parker, Department of Ornithology, South Australian Museum; Walter Boles, Department of Ornithology, Australian Museum; Glen Ingram and Wayne Longmore, Department of Ornithology, Queensland Museum, and Gerry van Tets, Division of Wildlife and Rangelands Research, CSIRO.

REFERENCES

Archer, M. and A. Baynes. 1972. Prehistoric mammal faunas from two small caves in the extreme southwest of Western Australia. J. R. Soc. West. Aust. 55: 80-89.

Baird, R. F. 1986. The Avian Portions of the Quaternary Cave
 Deposits of Southern Australia and their Biogeographical
 and Palaeoenvironmental Interpretations. Unpubl. PhD
 Thesis, Monash University: Clayton.

Baird, R. F. in press a. The taphonomy of late Quaternary cave localities yielding vertebrate remains in Australia. In Vertebrate Palaeontology of Australasia, P. V. Rich, R. F. Baird, J. Monaghan and T. H. Rich eds.

Baird, R. F. in press b. Avian fossils of pitfall origin from probable Late Pleistocene sediments in Amphitheatre Cave (G-2), south-western Victoria, Australia. Rec. Aust. Mus.

Baird, R. F. in prep. a. A fossil avian assemblage from late Quaternary sediments in Madura Cave (N-62), southeastern Western Australia.

Baird, R. F. in prep. b. Fossil remains of *Amytornis textilis* from the Bunda Plateau and their palaeoenvironmental implications.

Baynes, A. 1987. The original mammal fauna of the Nullarbor and southern peripheral regions: evidence from skeletal remains in superficial cave deposits. In A Biological Survey of the Nullarbor Region South and Western Australia in 1984. N. L. McKenzie and A. C. Robinson, eds., South Australian Department of Environment and Planning: Adelaide, 139-152.

- Beard, J. S. 1975. Nullarbor 1:1 000 000 Vegetation Series, Vegetation of the Nullarbor area, Vegetation Survey of Western Australia. Uni. W.A. Press. Nedlands, W.A.
- Blakers, M., Davies, S. J. J. F. and Reilly, P. N. 1984. The Atlas of Australian Birds. Melbourne University Press: Carlton.
- Brooker, M. G., Ridpath, M. G., Estbergs, A. J., Bywater, J., Hart, D. S. and Jones, M. S. 1979. Bird observations on the north-western Nullarbor Plain and neighboring regions, 1967-1978. Emu 79: 176-190.
- Baumel, J. J., King, A. S., Lucus, A. M., Breazile, J. E. and Evans, H. E. 1979. Nomina Anatomica Avium. Academic Press: London.
- Condon, H. T. 1975. Checklist of the Birds of Australia, I. Non-Passerines. Royal Australasian Ornithologists Union: Melbourne.
- Dell, J. 1979. Birds of the Buntine Nature Reserve. In Biological Survey of the Western Australian Wheatbelt, Pat 10: Buntine, Nungadong and East Nungadong nature Forest Reserves. Rec. West. Aust. Mus. Suppl. 9: 95-115.
- Johnson, E. R. L. and Baird, A. M. 1970. Notes on the flora and vegetation of the Nullarbor Plain at Forrest, W.A. J. R. Soc. West. Aust. 53: 46-61.
- Klau, W. L. 1985. Spotted Harriers Circus assimilis nesting on the Nullarbor Plain. Aust. Bird Watcher 11: 46-48.
- Lowry, J. W. J. and Merrilees, D. 1969. Age of the desiccated carcase of a thylacine (Marsupialia, Dasyuroidea) from Thylacine Hole, Nullarbor region, Western Australia. Helectite 7: 15-16.
- Mees, G. F. 1964. A revision of the Australian owls (Strigidae and Tytonidae). Zool. Verh., Leiden 65: 1-62.
- Merrilees, D. 1970. A check of the radiocarbon dating of desiccated Thylacine (Marsupial "Wolf") and dog tissue from Thylacine Hole, Nullarbor region, Western Australia. Helectite 8: 39-42.
- Parker, S. A. 1977. The distribution and occurrence in South Australia of owls of the genus *Tyto*. S. Aust. Orn. 27: 207-215.

- Parker, S. A. 1982. Remarks on the tympanic cavity of Malurus, Stipiturus and Amytornis (Passeriformes, Maluridae). S. Aust. Orn. 29: 17-22.
- Partridge, J. 1967. A 3,300 year old Thylacine (Marsupialia, Thylacinidae) from the Nullarbor Plain, Western Australia.
 J. R. Soc. West. Aust. 50: 57-59.
- Richards, A. M. 1971. An ecological study of the cavernicolous fauna of the Nullarbor Plain, South Australia. J. Zool (London) 164: 1-60.
- Rich, P. V. and van Tets, J. 1982. Fossil birds of Australia and New Guinea: their biogeographic, phylogenetic and biostratigraphic input. In The Fossil Vertebrate Record of Australasia. P. V. Rich and E. M. Thompson (Eds.) Monash University Offset Printing Unit: Clayton.
- Schodde, R. 1975. Interim List of Australian Songbirds. Passerines. Royal Australasian Ornithologists Union: Melbourne.
- Specht, R. L. 1981. Major vegetation formations in Australia. In Ecological Biogeography of Australia, A. Keast (Ed.) Dr W. Junk: The Hague.
- Storr, G. M. 1985. Birds of the mid-eastern interior of Western Australia. Rec. West. Aust. Mus. Suppl. 22: 1-45.
- van Tets, G. F. 1974. Fossil birds (Aves) from Weekes Cave, Nullarbor Plain, South Australia. **Trans. R. Soc. S. Aust.** 98: 229-230.
- von den Driesch, A. 1976. A Guide to the Measurement of Animal Bones from Archaeological Sites. Peabody Museum (Harvard University) Bulletin 1.
- Wakefield, N. A. 1972. Palaeoecology of fossil mammal
 assemblages from some Australian caves. Proc. R. Soc.
 Vict. 85: 1-29.

R. F. Baird: Victorian Institute of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Department of Earth Sciences, Monash University, Clayton, Victoria, 3168.

Received: 23 July 1990.